

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING

Arizona Game and Fish Commission
Appointment Recommendation Board
5000 West Carefree Highway
Phoenix, AZ 85086

PRESENT: (Board Members)

Susan E. Chilton, Chair
Charles Ireland Kelly
Edward P. Madden
Phillip D. Townsend
Richard Williams

Tuesday, October 19, 2021

(Directors Staff)

Linda Pollock, Assistant Attorney General
Cindy Freehauf, Secretary

Chairperson Chilton called the meeting to order at **9:00** a.m. This meeting followed an agenda dated October 09, 2021.

1. Welcome and Introductions from the Arizona Game and Fish Commission Appointment Recommendation Board

The Chair welcomed the general public, Board members and staff present.

The Chair introduced members and staff; Susan Chilton from Arivaca, representing Cattlemen or Ranchers; Charles Kelly from Phoenix, representing Mission to Increase, Sustain, and Conserve Wild Turkey, Deer, Elk, Pronghorn, Bighorn Sheep, Ducks, Quail, and Fish; Edward P. Madden from Flagstaff, representing a Public Member; Phil Townsend from Yuma, representing Sportsmen's Organization confined to a specific area or region; Richard Williams from Scottsdale, representing Wildlife Conservation and Sportsmen Organizations; Linda Pollock, Assistant Attorney General; and Cindy Freehauf, Secretary.

No board members wished to make any comment.

2. Overview of the Role and Conduct of Boards and Commissions under Arizona Law

Presenter: Linda Pollock, Assistant Attorney General

Assistant Attorney General, Linda Pollock, summarized the rules to be adhered to in these proceedings: (1) All discussions, deliberations, and votes must be in the presence of the public in public session. (2) As a Board member, any notes taken are public record. At the conclusion of the meeting, it is requested that Board members mail, fax, or scan any notes taken to Board secretary, Cindy Freehauf. (3) Board members may call for an executive session for legal advice only. (4) Board members should forward any communications from supporters of the candidates to the Board secretary for distribution to all board members before the November 9th interview meeting. (5) The conflict of interest law applies only if a Board member has a financial or proprietary tie to any candidate. Board members should state knowledge of a particular candidate

and at this time should recuse themselves if there is a financial or proprietary tie. If the Board member has no such tie to a candidate, he/she should state on the record that there is no pecuniary or proprietary interest in the selection of the candidate and the association will not affect an objective and impartial analysis of the candidate's qualifications for the position.

3. Disclosures and Recusals

The Chair asked to proceed with disclosures and recusals from each Board member:

Charles Kelly knows three of the candidates. He served with Jim O'Haco on the AZ Livestock Loss board. He met Robert Rimsza at an Arizona Sportsman for Wildlife Conservation awards ceremony. Lastly, he met Marsha Sue at various wildlife fundraisers and wildlife work projects around Arizona. No further disclosures or recusals.

Pat Madden knows Jim O'Haco through various contacts. No further disclosures or recusals.

Phil Townsend stated he has met James Cave as he had dinner at Phil's house. He has spoken with Mr. O'Haco by phone. He may have met Mr. Wikfords. No further disclosures or recusals.

Rich Williams knows some of the candidates by name. No further disclosures or recusals.

Sue Chilton knows Mr. O'Haco because her husband and Mr. O'Haco served on a board together. No further disclosures or recusals.

4. Call to Public

The Chair invited any public attendees, on the call-in line, who wanted to be heard.

There were no attendee or call-in comments from the public.

5. Discussion and Deliberation of Board Process and Procedures, Including the Process for Evaluating Applicants

Sue Chilton stated the Board members have received and individually reviewed the candidate's information. The process for evaluating applicants is as follows:

If one member of the board says 'further consideration' that means this person wants to hear more about this candidate. That name passes to a second reading. At the second reading, if no one says 'further consideration', then that name is no longer eligible for consideration. During the second reading, all those with two requests for 'further consideration' are invited to the next CARB meeting for an interview. Lastly a motion is made to accept the list of candidates for interview.

6. Review and Selection of Applicants for Interview

The Chair read the list of applicants' names in alphabetical order. The applicants receiving a vote of 'further consideration' and Board members who voted for 'further consideration' of that applicant are as follows:

McCune, Justine (Phil Townsend), (Rich Williams), (Pat Madden), (Charles Kelly)

O'Haco, James (Phil Townsend), (Rich Williams), (Pat Madden)

Rimsza, Robert (Rich Williams), (Charles Kelly)

Sue, Marsha (Charles Kelly), (Pat Madden), (Phil Townsend), (Rich Williams)

Chairperson Chilton stated the interview does need to be held in-person and not telephonically. The secretary confirmed the Board members will be notified when all candidates are confirmed and scheduled for their interviews.

MOTION: Charles Kelly moved and Rich Williams seconded to INVITE THE FOUR CANDIDATES WITH TWO OR MORE VOTES TO BE INTERVIEWED.

VOTE: Unanimous

7. Future Meeting Schedule and Location

The next meeting will be held on Tuesday, November 9, 2021 at 9:00 a.m., with interviews to begin at 9:15 a.m. The meeting will be held at the Arizona Game and Fish Department, Quail Room, 5000 West Carefree Highway, Phoenix, AZ 85086-5000.

8. Future Agenda Items

The Board will be interviewing selected applicants for recommendation to the Arizona Game and Fish Commission.

MOTION: Phil Townsend moved and Charles Kelly seconded to ADJOURN THE MEETING.

VOTE: Unanimous

The meeting adjourned at 9:17 a.m.
